

# EXHIBIT C

(Filed Under Seal; Highlighting in Original)

From: [REDACTED]  
Sent: Mon 4/9/2018 8:58:19 PM (UTC-08:00)  
Subject: Re: A/C Priv - Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

I'm not best able to answer that. [REDACTED] is our best POC (and/or [REDACTED] or [REDACTED] or [REDACTED] I believe a batch was added in 2012. My recollection is we have been ad hoc, but partnerships and enforcement may have more details.

Sent from my iPhone

On Apr 9, 2018, at 9:31 PM, Rebecca Hahn <[RHahn@theoutcastagency.com](mailto:RHahn@theoutcastagency.com)> wrote:

When did we do that?

---

From: [REDACTED] >  
Date: Monday, April 9, 2018 at 9:18 PM  
To: [REDACTED]  
Cc: [REDACTED]  
Rebecca Hahn <[RHahn@theoutcastagency.com](mailto:RHahn@theoutcastagency.com)>  
Subject: Re: A/C Priv - Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

True that ;)

Sent from my iPhone

On Apr 9, 2018, at 9:10 PM, [REDACTED] wrote:

**R8**

**Redacted**

[REDACTED] | Legal | Facebook, Inc.  
[REDACTED]

---

From: [REDACTED] >  
Date: Monday, April 9, 2018 at 11:56 PM  
To: [REDACTED] >  
Cc: [REDACTED]  
RhahnAtTheOutCastAgencyCom <[rhahn@theoutcastagency.com](mailto:rhahn@theoutcastagency.com)>  
Subject: Re: A/C Priv - Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

He can't figure this out on his own. He can ask developers but there isn't an independent way for him to find this out.

From: [REDACTED] <[REDACTED]>

To: [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] >

[illegible]

Rebecca Hahn

R7

# Redacted

| Legal | Facebook, Inc.

**From:** [REDACTED]

**Date:** Sunday, April 8, 2018 at 3:13 PM

To: [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] >

Cc: [REDACTED]

RhahnAtTheOutCastAgencyCom <[rhahn@theoutcastagency.com](mailto:rhahn@theoutcastagency.com)>, [REDACTED]

I can't confirm whether it was Snow or one of the many versions of Yellow that we added last as i am not close to my computer right now. Either way they are both (visual) messaging apps.

On Apr 8, 2018, at 4:56 PM, [REDACTED] wrote:

+ [REDACTED]

## R6

# Redacted

FB\_FTC\_CID\_02024697  
PALM-002033281



FB\_FTC\_CID\_02024698  
PALM-002033282

**R5 Redacted**

Legal | Facebook, Inc.

To: [REDACTED]

**R4 Redacted**

From: [REDACTED]

Date: Sunday, April 8, 2018 at 2:13 PM

To: [REDACTED]

Cc: Rebecca Hahn <[rhahn@theoutcastagency.com](mailto:rhahn@theoutcastagency.com)>

Subject: Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

**R3 Redacted**

Get [Outlook for iOS](#)

From: [REDACTED]

Sent: Sunday, April 8, 2018 2:07:32 PM

To: [REDACTED]

Cc: RhahnAtTheOutCastAgencyCom

Subject: Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

+ [REDACTED]

**R2 Redacted**

R2

# Redacted

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED] | Legal | Facebook, Inc.  
[REDACTED] | [REDACTED]

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Date:** Sunday, April 8, 2018 at 1:55 PM  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]  
**Cc:** RhahnAtTheOutCastAgencyCom <[rhahn@theoutcastagency.com](mailto:rhahn@theoutcastagency.com)>  
**Subject:** Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

Hello All,

We have historically restricted Messaging apps from having access to the users\_friends (including app friends). Pankaj/Alison have more authority to speak to this policy, but we have been keeping it broad enough to allow us to restrict apps that replicate core Facebook (most mostly Messenger functionality).

A few of the apps that have been in this list:

Twitter: 135811653099227, 2231777543

iTunes Ping: 146879158663523

Tweetdeck: 56212371378

Tellit: 358538967573629

YouTube: 87741124305

eBuddy: 2568656689, 127229817336080

Voxer: 108717019189000

TextPlus: 194671910604807

XMS: 137409049650615

MessageMe: 249820361808082

QQChat: 344134215672609

Band: 439691136064581

Line: 106149969545611

WeChat: 290293790992170

Snow: 654085398029607

Zalo: 198235073635027

Tribe: 1743579545897830

Yellow: 152071551534437, 478541172220486, 121523474607279,  
163120830425401, 214976725587824, 381126551909069, 189446171109854,  
420523694704108, 392431224194952, 353396508077924,

Also for completeness, a year or so ago, we had a debate about applying the



Best,

[REDACTED]

---

**From:** [REDACTED]

**Date:** Sunday, April 8, 2018 at 3:50 PM

**To:** [REDACTED]

**Cc:** RhahnAtTheOutCastAgencyCom <[rhahn@theoutcastagency.com](mailto:rhahn@theoutcastagency.com)>

**Subject:** Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

+ [REDACTED] who has policy context

---

**From:** [REDACTED]

**Date:** Sunday, April 8, 2018 at 1:31 PM

**To:** [REDACTED]

**Cc:** RhahnAtTheOutCastAgencyCom <[rhahn@theoutcastagency.com](mailto:rhahn@theoutcastagency.com)>

**Subject:** Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

Hi all,

I'm looping in @ [REDACTED] and @ [REDACTED] who I believe have been closely involved with this policy.

[REDACTED]

**R1 Redacted**

Get [Outlook for iOS](#)

---

**From:** [REDACTED]

**Sent:** Sunday, April 8, 2018 1:12 PM

**Subject:** Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

**To:** [REDACTED]

**Cc:** RhahnAtTheOutCastAgencyCom <[rhahn@theoutcastagency.com](mailto:rhahn@theoutcastagency.com)>

+ [REDACTED] and [REDACTED]

I don't know much about this [REDACTED] [REDACTED] and @ [REDACTED] [REDACTED], any insight you can provide here?

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Date:** Sunday, April 8, 2018 at 12:01 PM  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]  
**Cc:** [REDACTED], RhahnAtTheOutCastAgencyCom  
<[rhahn@theoutcastagency.com](mailto:rhahn@theoutcastagency.com)>  
**Subject:** Fwd: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

Who's the right person to handle this?

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** Josh Constine <[joshc@techcrunch.com](mailto:joshc@techcrunch.com)>  
**Date:** April 8, 2018 at 11:53:38 AM PDT  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

Hello,

I'm working on a story to be published this evening about Facebook's history of removing Find Friends access from apps that replicate core functionality or don't share content back.

Can you provide a list of apps that have had this happen? I know of Twitter, Vine, Voxer, MessageMe, Wonder, Phhphoto (cut off by Instagram), and Path (cut off for spamming uploaded phone contacts).

Does Facebook have a statement about why its policy states "You may not use Facebook Platform to promote, or to export user data to, a product or service that replicates a core Facebook product or service without our permission" (now listed as "Don't replicate core functionality that Facebook already provides." in the TOS)? How does Facebook respond to the criticism that if users want to share their friend list with another app and find their friends there, that Facebook blocking that is both anti-competitive and hurts users by reducing data portability?

What is Facebook's explanation for not allowing the Download  
Your Information export of friends' email addresses that are  
visible to a user on those friends' profiles?

Thanks,

--

Josh Constine  
Editor-At-Large, TechCrunch  
[\(585\)750-5674](tel:(585)750-5674)  
<http://www.twitter.com/JoshConstine>  
[joshc@techcrunch.com](mailto:joshc@techcrunch.com)